

## DEVELOPMENT OF HALAL PROCUREMENT PRACTICES: A META-ANALYSIS

SARA SHAKIRA SHARI<sup>1\*</sup>, KAMISAH SUPIAN<sup>2</sup>, MUZAIRIHANA MD MOID<sup>3</sup>, AL SARAH ALYAA AL BUHARI<sup>4</sup>, VIKNESWARAN KAJENDRAN<sup>5</sup>

<sup>1,2,3,4,5</sup> Faculty of Business and Accountancy, Universiti Selangor, Malaysia

\*Corresponding Author: sarashakira.shari@gmail.com

**Abstract:** The rapid competition among businesses is growing across the globe forcing them to seek their competitive advantages and procurement and halal practices are one of the ways to improve a company's performance. Various literature can be found to discuss the importance of procurement and halal as a competitive advantage. However, there is limited literature on halal integration and procurement. The increasing Muslim population directly influences the request for halal products and services. This situation shows the relevance of understanding the integration between halal and procurement. Thus, this paper is targeted to systemise the existing literature on the practices of halal procurement. A meta-analysis approach was conducted instead of carrying out a traditional literature review. This paper analyses articles that have been published between 2012 to 2022 and they are carried out using the Emerald database, and Google Scholar search engine. The preliminary phase consists of 20 articles; however, after the thorough exclusion, the meta-analysis was conducted based on six articles. The results conclude that supplier management holds a crucial role in the development of halal procurement. The findings of this paper are aimed at assisting future researchers to conduct a study on halal procurement practice.

**Keywords:** Halal Procurement, Halal Supply Chain, Meta-Analysis, Supplier

### 1. Introduction

Procurement plays a critical role in attaining sustainable results through the growth, production, administration, and preservation of relationships between businesses and their supply chains (Singh et al., 2020). Procurement is not a new notion in the business world, where it was evidenced by historical proof of total procurement from a trade deal between China and Greece around 800 BC for the silk business (Iqbal & Iqbal, 2018). Besides, procurement in any organisation aims to maximise the benefit by making the best use of resources while using the least amount of cash. Organisations should use strategic procurement methods, and techniques to maximise the benefit and contribute to the organisation's success. Currently, corporate entities procure a wide range of trading and nearly limitless goods, works, and services (Sinaga et al., 2021). Furthermore, procurement is important in operations because supplier selection and strategic supplier partnerships are all activities that can improve the company's efficiency (Bag et al., 2020).

The procurement process is a critical activity in any business because it remains the fact that a business cannot function properly without this process. The procurement process is part of the broader acquisition process, a critical component of supply chain management. Procurement is a business management function that is responsible for identifying, accessing,

and managing external resources that an organisation requires or may require to meet its strategic objectives. Procurement has been proven to benefit businesses both in the financial, and non-financial terms and provide a competitive advantage to the company by fulfilling customer satisfaction (Masudin et al., 2018).

Furthermore, competitive advantage refers to the magnitude of the competition over the competitors and it refers to the company's competence that allows it to separate itself from competitors in the market. Besides that, previous research discovered that the characteristics that give the organisation a competitive edge include premium pricing, reliable delivery, customer quality, manufacturing innovation, and competitive pricing. Businesses with the aforementioned qualities are thought to have a competitive edge over their market rivals (Ploenhad et al., 2019). Additionally, the company's competitive advantage can be improved by implementing halal practices (Noorliza, 2020). In recent years, the interest in the halal supply chain (HSC) is increasing, especially in the food industry, due to high demand from both Muslim and non-Muslim consumers. The halal supply chain enhances the conventional supply chain, which covers downstream and upstream groups with the additional element of Shariah practices (Azmi et al., 2019; Indarti et al., 2020).

Risks, consumers' perceptions, and contact with illegitimate are the three factors that form the halal foundation base of supply chain management (Usman, 2020). In generating profits and maintaining market position, the halal supply chain must maintain the integrity and quality of halal products in all supplies. Ensuring the quality, and integrity of products necessitate careful planning, and execution (Novianti et al., 2020). Additionally, Supian et al. (2018) conclude the importance of integrity in the halal supply chain, which involves the trust level between buyer and supplier. Halal traceability, halal integrity, halal procurement, and halal logistics are the main concept of the halal supply chain that has been studied. Multiple studies have been carried out for halal traceability (Ab Rashid & Bojei, 2019; Tan et al., 2020), integrity (Tan et al., 2017; Supian et al., 2018), and logistics (Faradina et al., 2018; Selim et al., 2019). However, the study on halal procurement is severely lacking despite its importance in the halal supply chain and the company's performance (Tieman et al., 2020).

## 2. Research Problem

Department of Statistics Malaysia (2021) stated that in the third quarter of 2021, businesses are more pessimistic about their business situation. The confidence indicator fell to -21.3 percent in the reference quarter, down from -3.1% in the previous quarter. The statistic shows the importance of reviewing business performance, and proper procurement practices are one of the ways. Procurement has been criticised for decades due to its inability to follow appropriate processes, and procedures. The incompetence of businesses to implement a purchasing function resulted in high operational costs and discriminatory decisions, which reduced the company's performance in terms of income generated (Kakwezi & Nyeko, 2019). There are long-standing problems with traditional procurement systems: inaccuracies, labour consumption, slow-to-respond information, inefficiency, and excessive data, in particular time and money, as well as extreme uncertainty in many instances (Alsetoohy & Ayoun, 2018).

Increasing global competition influences manufacturing enterprises because it burdens finite resources, affecting their availability and cost competitiveness (Bag et al., 2020). According to Shahbaz et al. (2018), to boost overall productivity and efficacy, there are many ways to go about doing so, and implementing a constructive supply chain is considered the most effective approach. A company's success is largely dependent on the quality of its procurement. As a business grows, the procurement and purchasing department becomes increasingly critical to its success (Ibrahim, 2021). The integration of halal means and mechanisms in daily activities has been proven to provide a positive impact. It is suggested that the practices of halal procurement can improve business performance. Thus, this study is targeted to analyse the development of halal procurement practices. Two objectives are developed for this study, which is (i) to identify the main findings for halal procurement, and (ii) to identify the methods that are used in discussing halal procurement. Generally, with the increasing demand for halal industries, the concern about fulfilling customer satisfaction and needs in this field, as well as requests for halal procurement entail research to be conducted to better understand this sector and provide solutions to counter problems facing the halal industry hence enhancing the business to perform.

### 3. Literature Review

The concept of halal procurement is relatively new, with the first study conducted by Tieman and Ghazali (2013) mentioning halal purchasing. The study found that halal significantly affects purchasing and procurement strategies. Then, in 2020, Tieman et al. did a focus group discussion with food industry players. The main focus was to determine the best halal procurement strategy that can be implemented. Their study also discusses that a strict halal policy would reduce the likelihood of halal risks becoming out of control in the supply chain. The idea is to combine halal compliance with food safety because the brand ensures proper handling of the business and halal status. The existence of halal procurement assists companies in evaluating and achieving business targets for the process of procuring halal materials and halal distribution following the authorities' regulations (Ramadhan et al., 2019). Ensuring the procurement function in halal compliant shows the business holds the responsible Islamic business ethics. The top management should start the integration of halal by developing a halal policy that acts as the basis for supplier selection, and procurement (Yusoff et al., 2017).

Halal procurement is part of halal supply chain management (Rasi et al., 2017) and the integrity of halal is protected throughout the supply chain process by halal procurement practices (Novianti et al., 2020). There are three processes involved in halal procurement that protect integrity: purchase activity, supplier management, and checking of quality and product received (Zahra et al., 2019). Moreover, halal personnel demands the establishment of a halal procurement procedure as the existing purchasing activities do not comply with shariah practices (Ahmad et al., 2017). The inability to ensure that procurement practices are parallel with shariah law will cause the company's performance to drop. Supply chain management is important for organisations, especially during economic uncertainties (Craighead et al., 2020). Thus, businesses must integrate the conventional supply chain with shariah elements to fulfil the global demand for halal practices. Furthermore, Wan Hassan et al. (2016) mentioned that procurement in the halal supply chain is very important as it

reduces cost and product and supply discontinuity can be avoided, which will then ultimately improve the company's performance.

#### **4. Methodology**

This study uses a meta-analysis design, a secondary study form that identifies, explores, and interprets all relevant studies related to a topic domain. A meta-analysis is valid, objective, and forms a scientific method of analysing, and combining multiple results. A meta-analysis is a statistical procedure examining and synthesising several related findings of studies. Although the term "similar" is not defined in this context, it is critical to ensure that when selecting a topic for the meta-analysis, the different studies present data that can be combined (Ahn & Kang, 2018). The advantages of using meta-analysis are that it helps overcome the difficulties of achieving effective synthesis when dealing with a large number of research results. Investigating the effect size of each sample in revealing the features of the total population is the basis of meta-analysis. It is concurrently solving the problem of studies with large sample sizes (Chen et al., 2021). Meta-analysis is increasingly being used in the social sciences. It is intended to deal with a large number of empirical studies, many of which produce contradictory results. Papers on a particular topic are collected systematically to conduct a meta-analysis (Matysiak & Vignoli, 2008).

##### **4.1 Search Strategy and Data Sources**

The search strategy for this study started by specifying the publication period of the articles, which is between the years 2012 to 2022. In narrowing down the scope of previous research on halal procurement, several databases have been selected, namely (i) Emerald and (ii) Google Scholars. Both of these databases and internet search engines were selected because they could increase the chances of finding relevant literature. However, there are possibilities that some research in the related studies is passed over, hence we employed 'or' and in various combinations to obtain as many relevant halal procurement articles as possible. The articles are further filtered based on their topical relevance, citations, and publication year (Hong et al., 2018). A total of 20 articles were extracted during the early phase of article selection. Results from the literature review and analysis findings were explained accordingly.

##### **4.2 Eligibility Criteria**

In ensuring the analysed data answers the objective appropriately, selected studies are carefully chosen to meet certain criteria, which are: (i) original studies that employed both qualitative, and quantitative methods, (ii) keywords that include halal procurement, halal supply chain, halal food supply chain, halal integrity, halal traceability, procurement, and halal supply chain management, (iii) published journal article. Additionally, there is no restriction on the language used and the type of publication. Matysiak and Vignoli (2008) stated that selecting studies that conform to certain languages might cause other nations to be underrepresented in the study, which has been a frequent issue in the literature review. Since there are limited studies available, only two criteria were set to fulfil the objectives of this paper. From the earlier selection of 20 articles, the paper was limited to those that specifically

discuss "halal procurement" and "halal purchasing". Next, the preliminary selected papers that do not have journal articles were excluded. Finally, six articles were identified that met the set criteria.

## 5. Findings

**Research Question 1:** What is the study's main finding related to halal procurement?

Based on the analysis conducted, it can be seen that supplier plays a crucial role in the development of halal procurement. Table 1 shows the findings of the halal procurement study. Even though different studies have different objectives, the findings, to a certain level, discussed the existence of supplier elements in halal procurement. All selected studies discuss the relationship between supplier management, and halal procurement. Since halal procurement involves the upstream supply chain network, the integration, evaluation and selection of suppliers are the main activities involved in practices of halal procurement (Tieman & Ghazali, 2013).

Table 1. Main Findings of Halal Procurement

Studies	Objectives	Findings
Tieman & Ghazali (2013)	To discuss the maturity stage of halal procurement and key components of the halal purchasing function.	The maturity stage should ensure that the supply and value chain are halal compliant, as it improves and strengthens supplier relationships.
Tieman et al. (2020)	To obtain a better understanding of the halal procurement strategies for the food industry.	Halal procurement is based on the foundation of reputation and risk management. Broad choices of halal suppliers will improve operational performance.
Wan Hassan et al. (2016)	To capture the understanding and issues that arise in the company's halal implementation.	Material quality and specifications vary depending on the supplier. It has been discovered that integrating buyer-supplier relationships and networks could help the halal industry to become more competitive in the future.
Rasi et al. (2017)	To understand the practices of HSC among Malaysia's organisation.	Each interview session mentioned collaboration between organisations and suppliers. Manufacturing firms are having difficulty locating dependable suppliers who can meet JAKIM's requirements.
Haryono & Handayani, (2018)	To identify the relationship between variables between the elements of a system related to the halal traceability system.	Halal procurement, one of the main factors of halal supply chain, is strongly involved with suppliers in both internal and external traceability.
Putri et al. (2019)	To identify a system for deciding halal compliance ingredients and vendors.	ERP-based halal procurement allows businesses to choose suppliers that can provide ingredients with halal standards.

Le et al. (2021) found that a high-quality relationship between buyers and suppliers will improve products, and service quality and meet customer demand. When buyers, and suppliers have a solid working relationship, suppliers can gain a better understanding of buyers and become more involved in the supply chain. Close relationships and good

communication with suppliers are proven to improve quality-related performance for businesses. Through these practices, buyers and suppliers can work together to solve quality problems and share quality information (Yu & Huo, 2019). Additionally, conventional procurement centred on keeping suppliers at arm's length and cutting costs; nevertheless, businesses came to appreciate the importance of procurement and built better supplier relationships, which subsequently evolved into supplier relationship management (Bag et al., 2020).

**Research Question 2:** What research methods have been used to conduct research on halal procurement?

In general, researchers can adopt three approaches consisting of qualitative, quantitative, and mixed-method. Each method has different design in carrying out the data collection and presenting data analysis. Methodologies might be defined generally, such as qualitative or quantitative, or specifically referred, for example, grounded theory or experimental. Methodologies, like theories, cannot be true or incorrect but merely more or less beneficial, depending on how well they match with the theories and procedures being employed, as well as the hypothesis being investigated or the chosen topic of the study (Smith & Zajda, 2018). Table 2 shows the approaches and the design used by selected studies in discussing the concept of halal procurement.

Based on the analysis, there is one research approach used that is qualitative. As for the design of the study, it varies between interviews, case studies, and concept papers. It is frequently asserted that qualitative data analysis is difficult, time-intensive, and requires little theoretical attention. The process can be tedious in the lack of explicit directions on how to analyse qualitative data using specific approaches, especially for inexperienced researchers. The qualitative method underlines the contextual understanding with the emphasis on researchers seeking to understand among others behaviour, attitudes, beliefs in terms of the environment in which the study is done. As a result, qualitative research is more likely to bring relevant contextualization, and clarity to study issues. By offering extensive, in-depth descriptions, qualitative research delivers insights that are difficult to achieve with quantitative measurements (Azungah, 2018).

Table 2. Methods and Design of the studies

Approaches	Design	Sample Group	f	Studies
Qualitative	Conceptual Paper	Food Industry	N	Tieman & Ghazali (2013)
Qualitative	Focus Group Discussion	Food Industry	8	Tieman et al. (2020)
Qualitative	Interpretive Structural Model (ISM)	Food Industry	N	Haryono & Handayani (2018)
Qualitative	Descriptive	Food Industry	N	Novianti et al. (2020)
Qualitative	In-depth Interview	Food Industry	5	Rasi et al. (2017)
Qualitative	Case Study	Cosmetic Industry	1	Putri et al. (2019)
Qualitative	Interview	Food Industry	11	Azlan Wan Hassan et al. (2016)

Additionally, based on the above table, it can be seen that the majority of the sample groups are from the food industry, whereby only one sample is from the cosmetic industry. Despite the importance of halal practices in business policy, the study of halal in other industries is still lacking. Besides food, multiple emerging industries integrated halal in the field, such as tourism, pharmaceutical, fashion, media, and recreation. Therefore, it is suggested that halal practices should be introduced, implemented and empirically evident to other industries.

## 6. Discussion

Based on the discussion above, supplier management plays a crucial role in the development of halal procurement practices. Despite the limited references available, all selected studies agreed that by improving supplier relationships, the concept of halal procurement is strengthened, eventually increasing the halal supply chain efficiency and enhancing business performance. Supplier management is about determining the appropriate number of suppliers or the supplier base and managing supplier relationships. Traditional supplier development tactics include direct involvement activities, incentives and rewards, and warnings and penalties (Tiemann et al., 2020). Moreover, supplier management has become increasingly important due to the increasing levels of outsourcing occurring within global supply chains. As the business environment becomes more competitive, firms recognise the need to outsource non-core products or activities while allocating the majority of their resources and capabilities to core competencies (Amoako-gyampah et al., 2018). Previous research found that improved productivity and cost reduction can be helped by better aid (Ku et al., 2020).

Additionally, to remain competitive in uncertain environments, especially in developing economies, establishing and maintaining a mutual relationship with vendors is critical (Amoako-gyampah et al., 2018). The consequence of a good relationship with vendors, would result in inventory reduction and improvements in buyer satisfaction, costs, time, and the launch of new products (Martins et al., 2017). Refined risk management and organisational sustainability are also the results of a strategic supplier relationship. A study by Fujiwara (2017) found that Ajinomoto, a Japanese food company, lost significant business in Indonesia. His study found that Ajinomoto's halal certification food products were recalled and boycotted due to their inability to discern the usage of porcine enzyme in their suppliers' operations, thus damaging the company's reputation. The study shows the importance of information integration with suppliers, which can be practised with a strong relationship with the vendor.

Previous literature discussed the measurement of supplier relationship management, which consists of supplier supervision, converting rivalry to opportunity, identifying the supplier's capabilities, enhancing technical and product development of suppliers' capabilities, and intensive information integration with suppliers (Dubey et al., 2019). Furthermore, multiple studies (Supian & Rashid, 2018; Dubey et al., 2019; Hardwick et al., 2019) have discussed the relationship between trust, commitment, and supplier relationship. These studies conclude that trust-based supplier relationships will improve business in financial and non-financial terms. In an inter-firm relationship, trust is extremely important.

Each party's ambition is to preserve and strengthen its commercial connections (Supian et al., 2018). Since halal procurement is related to supplier management, and despite the concept in the developing phase, business players can start with the building of trust with vendors as the first step of implementing halal procurement practices.

Other than that, all selected studies adopted a qualitative approach to analyse the methods. The design conducted is either interview, case study, or discussion. The tabulation shows that most studies (n=5) focus on the food industry, and only one discusses the perspective of the cosmetic industry. Therefore, the size effect of the studies, and homogeneity testing calculations were not discussed.

## 7. Conclusion

Since halal procurement is still at the infant level, the field discussing the element of halal procurement is limited to the food industry and restricted to the production stage only. An existing literature agrees that halal procurement provides a significant advantage to businesses in various industries. This scenario indicates that halal procurement heavily holds on the practices of integrity for products, and services. As a growing number of businesses are now halal-certified, the complexity of halal-requirements in product, and sourcing of service is a growing concern for procurement professionals. As halal expands into the realm of purchasing, there must be an effective alignment between the halal policy, procurement strategy, and purchasing process. Business players and academicians should pursue these discoveries to advance further in this field of research. Thus, more rigorous study should be carried out to develop the halal procurement concept further.

Nonetheless, this study has certain drawbacks. First, the study only employed the electronic database Google Scholar and one database, Emerald, which may not cover all halal procurement studies comprehensively. Second, to answer the research questions, this study depends on particular terms in the search stage, which may have eliminated other subjects. However, the omitted topics might be examined further by addressing distinct aims in a separate literature study. It is suggested that future studies propose other elements and theories for halal procurement. Furthermore, since the available study on halal procurement covers mainly the food industry, it is recommended that the researcher expand the target group to other industries that significantly impact the economy. In addition, this paper provides a better understanding of the procurement function in a halal supply chain and value chain; however, more empirical research is required in halal procurement to better understand the challenges and solutions surrounding the sourcing practises of halal-certified companies.

## References

- Ab Rashid, N., & Bojei, J. (2019). The relationship between halal traceability system adoption and environmental factors on halal food supply chain integrity in Malaysia. *Journal of Islamic Marketing*, 11(1), 117–142. <https://doi.org/10.1108/JIMA-01-2018-0016>
- Ahmad, A. N., Abdul Rahman, R., Othman, M., & Ungku Zainal Abidin, U. F. (2017). Critical success factors affecting the implementation of halal food management systems:



- Perspective of halal executives, consultants and auditors. *Food Control*, 74, 70–78. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodcont.2016.11.031>
- Ahn, E., & Kang, H. (2018). Introduction to Systematic Review and Meta-Analysis: A Health Care Perspective. *Korean Journal of Anesthesiology*, 71(2), 1–38. <https://doi.org/10.4097/kjae.2018.71.2.103>
- Alsetoohy, O., & Ayoun, B. (2018). Intelligent agent technology: the relationships with hotel food procurement practices and performance. *Journal of Hospitality and Tourism Technology*. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1108/JHTT-04-2017-0028>
- Amoako-gyampah, K., Boakye, K. G., Adaku, E., & Famiyeh, S. (2018). Supplier relationship management and firm performance in Developing Economies: A moderated mediation analysis of flexibility capability and ownership structure. *International Journal of Production Economics*. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijpe.2018.11.021>
- Azmi, F. R., Abdullah, A., Musa, H., & Wan Mahmood, W. H. (2019). Perception of food manufacturers towards adoption of halal food supply chain in Malaysia: Exploratory factor analysis. *Journal of Islamic Marketing*, 11(3), 571–589. <https://doi.org/10.1108/JIMA-12-2018-0236>
- Azungah, T. (2018). Qualitative research: deductive and inductive approaches to data analysis. *Qualitative Research Journal*, 18(4), 383–400. <https://doi.org/10.1108/QRJ-D-18-00035>
- Bag, S., Wood, L. C., Mangla, S. K., & Luthra, S. (2020). Procurement 4.0 and its implications on business process performance in a circular economy. *Resources, Conservation & Recycling*, 152(September 2019), 1–14. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.resconrec.2019.104502>
- Chen, L., Jia, F., Li, T., & Zhang, T. (2021). Supply chain leadership and firm performance: A meta-analysis. *International Journal of Production Economics*, 235(December 2020), 108082. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijpe.2021.108082>
- Craighead, C. W., Ketchen, D. J., & Darby, J. L. (2020). Pandemics and Supply Chain Management Research: Toward a Theoretical Toolbox\*. *Decision Sciences*, 51(4), 838–866. <https://doi.org/10.1111/deci.12468>
- Department of Statistics Malaysia. (2021). *Business Tendency Statistics Third Quarter 2021* (Issue August). [https://www.dosm.gov.my/v1/index.php?r=column/cthemByCat&cat=150&bul\\_id=TGRJUFduTVFZYUdzK1BpanNhTkhPQT09&menu\\_id=YmJrMEFKT0p0WUIxbDI1bzZydW9JQT09](https://www.dosm.gov.my/v1/index.php?r=column/cthemByCat&cat=150&bul_id=TGRJUFduTVFZYUdzK1BpanNhTkhPQT09&menu_id=YmJrMEFKT0p0WUIxbDI1bzZydW9JQT09)
- Dubey, R., Gunasekaran, A., Childe, S. J., Papadopoulos, T., & Helo, P. (2019). Supplier relationship management for circular economy: Influence of external pressures and top management commitment. *Management Decision*, 57(4), 767–790. <https://doi.org/10.1108/MD-04-2018-0396>
- Faradina, A., Hussein, M. Z., Husny, Z. J., Yazid, M., Mazlan, Z., Rayner, T., Fauziah, A. R., Zani, M., & Adnan, N. (2018). Halal logistics: Halal integrity and legal enforcement challenges. *International Journal of Supply Chain Management*, 7(4), 42–47.
- Fujiwara, T. (2017). Supplier management in halal food supply chain: A preliminary case study. *Pertanika Journal of Social Sciences and Humanities*, 25(December), 25–38.
- Hardwick, J., Anderson, A. R., International, L., Pool, B., & Ln, L. (2019). Supplier-customer engagement for collaborative innovation using video conferencing : A study of SMEs. *Industrial Marketing Management*, 80, 43–57.

- <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.indmarman.2019.02.013>
- Haryono, H., & Handayani, D. I. (2018a). Pemodelan Sistem Traceability Halal Supply Chain dalam menjaga Integritas Produk Makanan Halal Dengan Pendekatan Interpretive Structural Modeling (ISM). *PROZIMA (Productivity, Optimization and Manufacturing System Engineering)*, 2(2), 70. <https://doi.org/10.21070/prozima.v2i2.2196>
- Haryono, & Handayani, D. I. (2018b). Pemodelan Sistem Traceability Halal Supply Chain dalam Menjaga Integritas Produk Makanan Halal Dengan Pendekatan Interpretive Structural Modeling (ISM). *Productivity, Optimization, and Manufacturing System*, 2(2), 70–79.
- Hong, Z., Lee, C. K. M., & Zhang, L. (2018). Procurement risk management under uncertainty: a review. *Industrial Management and Data Systems*, 118(7), 1547–1574. <https://doi.org/10.1108/IMDS-10-2017-0469>
- Ibrahim, S. Z. (2021). Benefits E-Procurement System. *Advances in Business Research International Journal*, 7(1), 142–149.
- Kakwezi, P., & Nyeko, S. (2019). Procurement Processes and Performance: Efficiency and Effectiveness of the procurement function. *Int Journal of Social Sciences Management and Entrepreneurship*, 3(1), 172–182.
- Ku, E. C. S., Hsu, S.-F., & Wu, W.-C. (2020). Connecting supplier–supplier relationships to achieve supply chain performance of restaurant companies. *Journal of Hospitality and Tourism*, 3(3), 311–328. <https://doi.org/10.1108/JHTI-10-2019-0113>
- Le, S., Wu, J., & Zhong, J. (2021). Relationship quality and supply chain quality performance: The effect of supply chain integration in hotel industry. *Computational Intelligence*, 37(3), 1388–1404. <https://doi.org/10.1111/coin.12379>
- Martins, G. S., Rossoni, L., Duarte, A. L. C. M., & Martins, R. S. (2017). Supply chain relationships: Exploring the effects of both relational and structural embeddedness on operational performance. *International Journal of Procurement Management*, 10(5), 639–664. <https://doi.org/10.1504/IJPM.2017.086404>
- Matysiak, A., & Vignoli, D. (2008). *Fertility and Women's Employment : A Meta-analysis*. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10680-007-9146-2>
- Novianti, D., Arkeman, Y., Almunawar, M. N., & Haditjaroko, L. (2020). Designing a Transparent Distributed Systems for Halal Supply Chains Using Blockchain Technology. *Journal of Business & Economic Analysis*, 3(2), 151–170. <https://doi.org/10.36924/sbe.2020.3204>
- Ploenhad, J., Laoprawatchai, P., Thongrawd, C., & Jermstiparsert, K. (2019). Mediating role of competitive advantage on the relationship of supply chain management and organisational performance on the food industry of Thailand. *International Journal of Supply Chain Management*, 8(4), 216–226.
- Putri, F. S., Ridwan, A. Y., & Puspitasari, W. (2019). Design of halal system procurement base on enterprise resource planning using odoo in cosmetic industry (study case: cv. skin solution beauty care Indonesia). *EProceeding of Engineering*, 6(2), 8350–8359. <https://openlibrarypublications.telkomuniversity.ac.id/index.php/engineering/article/view/10870>
- Rasi, R. Z., Masrom, N. R., Omar, S. S., Ahmad, M. F., & Sham, R. (2017). Designing Halal Supply Chain: Malaysia's Halal Industry Scenarios. *MATEC Web of Conferences*, 135, 00040. <https://doi.org/10.1051/mateconf/201713500040>
- Selim, N. I. I. B., Zailani, S., Aziz, A. A., & Rahman, M. K. (2019). Halal logistic services, trust and

- satisfaction amongst Malaysian 3PL service providers. *Journal of Islamic Marketing*. <https://doi.org/10.1108/JIMA-05-2018-0088>
- Shahbaz, M. S., Rasi, R. Z. R., Ahmad, M. F. Bin, & Sohu, S. (2018). The impact of supply chain collaboration on operational performance: Empirical evidence from manufacturing of Malaysia. *International Journal of ADVANCED AND APPLIED SCIENCES*, 5(8), 64–71. <https://doi.org/10.21833/ijaas.2018.08.009>
- Sinaga, O., Mohd Saudi, N. S., Baker, R., Mohd Nazri, N. S., & Amirul, A. S. (2021). Assessing the Effectiveness of Procurement Systems and Geographic Location in Achieving Service Quality in Public Sector. *Review of International Geographical Education (RIGEO)*, 11(1), 677–684. <https://doi.org/10.48047/rigeo.11.1.54>
- Singh, P. K., Ismail, F., Wei, C. S., Imran, M., & Ahmed, S. A. (2020). A framework of E-Procurement technology for sustainable procurement in ISO 14001 certified firms in Malaysia. *Advances in Science, Technology and Engineering Systems*, 5(4), 424–431. <https://doi.org/10.25046/AJ050450>
- Smith, K., & Zajda, J. (2018). Qualitative and Quantitative Methodologies: A Minimalist View. *Education and Society*, 36(1), 73–83. <https://doi.org/10.7459/es/36.1.06>
- Supian, K., Abdullah, Mokhtar, & Ahmad, H. (2018). Halal practices integrity and halal supply chain trust in Malaysian halal food supply chain. *International Food Research Journal*, 25(December), S57–S62.
- Supian, K., & Rashid, N. A. (2018). The Role of Supplier, Top Management and Government in Halal Practices Integrity of Malaysian Food Business. *International Journal of Asian Social Science*, 8(8), 549–559. <https://doi.org/10.18488/journal.1.2018.88.549.559>
- Tan, A., Gligor, D., & Ngah, A. (2020). Applying Blockchain for Halal food traceability. *International Journal of Logistics Research and Applications*, 1–18. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13675567.2020.1825653>
- Tan, K. H., Ali, M. H., Makhbul, Z. M., & Ismail, A. (2017). The impact of external integration on halal food integrity. *Supply Chain Management*, 22(2), 186–199. <https://doi.org/10.1108/SCM-05-2016-0171>
- Tieman, M., & Ghazali, M. C. (2013). Principles in halal purchasing. *Journal of Islamic Marketing*, 4(3), 281–293. <https://doi.org/10.1108/JIMA-01-2012-0004>
- Tieman, M., Zakaria, Z., Sulaiman, A., & Ramli, S. Q. (2020). Halal procurement strategy in the food industry: a focus group discussion. *International Journal of Islamic Marketing and Branding*, 5(3), 167–180. <https://doi.org/10.1504/ijimb.2020.10035279>
- Usman, I. (2020). Halal supply chain management practice model: A case study in evidence of halal supply chain in Indonesia. *International Journal of Innovation, Creativity and Change*, 11(11), 440–451.
- Wan Hassan, W. A., Ahmad, R. M. T. R. L., Hamid, A., & Mohd Zainuddin, N. M. (2016). The Perception on Halal Supply Chain Management Systems Implementation of SMEs in Selangor. *Indian Journal of Science and Technology*, 9(34). <https://doi.org/10.17485/ijst/2016/v9i34/100843>
- Yu, Y., & Huo, B. (2019). The impact of relational capital on supplier quality integration and operational performance. *Total Quality Management and Business Excellence*, 30(11–12), 1282–1301. <https://doi.org/10.1080/14783363.2017.1366265>
- Yusoff, T., Abdul Razak, I., & Abdul Aziz, A. (2017). Halal Integrated Logistic Management System: Lesson Learnt from Malaysian Industries. *First International Halal Management*

*Conference, August, 0–17.* <https://www.researchgate.net/publication/321069012>  
Zahra, D. K., Ridwan, A. Y., & Saputra, M. (2019). Halal SCM : How to Monitor Halal Performance of Procurement Process for Food Industry in Indonesia by Using ERP System. *International Conference on Rural Development and Entrepreneurship 2019: Enhancing Small Business and Rural Development Toward Industrial Revolution 4.0*, 5(1), 1300–1318.